

## Using Record Analysis to Establish Relationships between various Whitman adults in Greenbrier County, Virginia before 1820

According to published accounts George and Phoebe Whitman had 7 children born in Orange County New York. Around the time of George's death in 1793, the family supposedly moved to the wilds of Greenbrier County, Virginia. However, none of the published histories provide evidence linking Phoebe or George to their supposed children or establish a date for a move to Virginia. This project began by trying to establish, if possible, that these Whitman individuals were in fact a family group.

Two slender privately printed genealogies trace the Whitman family of Greenbrier County, West Virginia and there are sketchy accounts of various branches of the family published in Greenbrier and Pocahontas County Histories. The *Whitman Family History as of Sept. 2, 1983*<sup>1</sup> (hereafter referred to as *Whitman History*) and *Family Histories, part 1: The Whitman and Rogers Families of New York and Greenbrier County, West Virginia*, by Homer Cooper<sup>2</sup> (hereafter called *Cooper's History*.) have many common points. However, *Cooper's History* and the *Whitman History* differ on the birth order of the children and the different level of detail regarding birth, marriage and death information is striking. After the 1<sup>st</sup> generation in Greenbrier County, the two genealogies follow different lines of descent. The authors of the two genealogies do not appear to have been aware of the other's work.

The *Whitman History* gives the following list of children:<sup>3</sup>

	Born	Married	Date	Died
William Whitman	9 Mar 1779	Elizabeth Ervin	2 Apr 1807	20 Aug 1852
Julia Whitman	About 1781	Chris. Foglesong	9 Mar 1797	
Ann Whitman	About 1783	Thos. Masters	9 Mar 1799	
George Whitman	About 1785	Elizabeth Rogers	17 May 1804	
Andrew Whitman	About 1787	Elizabeth Prince	2 Nov 1808	
Holly Whitman	About 1789	Sarah Ervin	15 Apr 1811	Aug 1825
Phoebe Whitman	About 1791	James White	6 Nov 1815	9 May 1866

*Cooper's History* provides this list:<sup>4</sup>

Children of George & Phebe:

1. Julia Whitman - Married 1797, Greenbrier County, to Christopher Foglesong (1762-1846).
2. Ann Whitman - Married 1797, Greenbrier County, to Thomas Masters...
3. George Whitman - Born during 1775-1784 in New York (probably Orange County.) Died about 1826....

---

<sup>1</sup>Nell and Harry Whitman, *Whitman Family History as of Sept. 2, 1983* (Merriam, KS: privately printed, September 1983). Hereinafter cited as *Whitman History*. Title page note: "this Whitman Family History compiled from Mormon Church Archive Records in Salt Lake City, Utah. James E. Whitman's Bible and from Records and memory of Nellie Valentine Whitman McLeland and Lottie Whitman Maxwell both of Pleasanton, Kansas in 1941 and 1942. Also by research work from the National Archives" (There is no documentation in this history except for a single line on page 1, "the above information is taken from the Mormon Church Archive records at Salt Lake City, Utah" referring apparently to the dates and place given for the children's births and marriages. The present whereabouts of the bible of James E. Whitman son of Holly Whitman are unknown.)

<sup>2</sup>Homer C. Cooper, *Family Histories (part I: Whitman and Rodgers Family of New York and Greenbrier County, West VA)*, (Athens, GA: privately printed, 1968): FHL microfilm #0908261 item 3. Hereinafter cited as *Cooper's History*. (Cooper is less certain (and less specific) as to the place of birth for George and Phoebe Whitman. He does state that George Whitman "died before 1793, probably in Orange County, New York." Cooper also notes, "Proof is lacking that Julia, Ann, and Andrew were members of this family. They are included because their names recur in many branches of the family." Cooper appears to have access to unpublished family letters discussing George and Phoebe and seems to have been a careful researcher who did not engage in baseless speculation. However, except for the two citations quoted above, *Cooper's History* is also undocumented.)

<sup>3</sup>*Whitman Family History*, page 1.

<sup>4</sup>*Cooper's History*, page 1.

4. William Whitman - Born 1779, Goshen Township, Orange County, New York, according to William T. Price, *Historical Sketches of Pocahontas County*, Price Brothers, Marlinton, 1901, page 378. Died 1852, Greenbrier County, W.Va. Married 1807, Greenbrier County, to Elizabeth Erwin.
5. Andrew Whitman - Married 1808, Greenbrier County, to Elizabeth Prince....
6. Holly Whitman – died Jackson County, Ohio about 1825. Married 1811, Greenbrier County, to Sally Ervin.
7. Phebe Whitman - Born about 1791 in New York (probably Orange County). Died May 1866, Greenbrier County, W. VA. Married 1815, Greenbrier County, to James White. Phebe's death record, which gives New York, as her birthplace is Greenbrier County death register 1-A, page 60, line 32.

The goal of this project was to try to establish that these Whitman individuals (and others discovered during the research) were in fact a family group. Once this fact was established or disproved then research could begin into the origins of the Greenbrier Whitman family.<sup>5</sup>

**George Whitman** – Deed, survey, court, probate, land and property tax records fail to provide any evidence of a George Whitman prior to the 1804 marriage of George Whitman and Elizabeth Rodgers.<sup>6</sup> Assuming that this a first marriage for this George and that he was woman relatively close in age to his wife, it would appear that this George is of a younger generation than the George and Phoebe Whitman proposed as parents for this family. The only Greenbrier record of a George in the same generation as Phoebe Whitman is the 1866 death certificate of Phoebe Whitman White, discussed in greater detail later.<sup>7</sup> Therefore the older George's existence and connections to the other Whitmans must remain conjecture until the family can be followed back to their place of origin.

**Phoebe (?) Whitman** - Phoebe Whitman appears by name in a handful of records in Greenbrier County. However, those records give us a picture of an independent woman who purchases land, raises children, pays taxes and when she remarries in her later years provides for the transfer of her pre-nuptial property to her children.

She first appears in Greenbrier County records on 30 July 1793 when Feebe (*sic*) Whitman purchases 70 acres "adjacent to the town survey" from Christopher Bryan and wife Catherine of the Kentucky District for 5 shillings.<sup>8</sup> Her first appearance, as Phebey (*sic*) Whitman, on the personal property tax lists is in 1794 with no tithables but 1 horse.<sup>9</sup> Feby (*sic*) appears on the 1794 land tax rolls charged with 70 acres as the assignee of Wm. Welch.<sup>10</sup> This 1794 appearance on the land tax lists is the only time she appears on those lists under her full name. There is a Whitman assessed for the 70 acres as assignee of Wm.

<sup>5</sup> During research on this project contact was made with descendants of 4 of these Whitman families. The Orange County, New York origins of the Whitman family appears to be traditional in all 4 lines. However, there were descendants of all lines, except the Holly Whitman line, living in Greenbrier County at least as late as 1960, so it is possible that the tradition has not been independently maintained in each line.

<sup>6</sup> Greenbrier County Marriage 1A: page 11, County Clerk's Office, Greenbrier County Courthouse, Lewisburg, West Virginia: FHL microfilm #595040. Hereinafter cited as Greenbrier Marriage Records.

<sup>7</sup> Larry G. Shuck, *Greenbrier County Death Records, 1853-1901, Greenbrier County, [W] Virginia Records, Vol. VI* (Athens, GA: Iberian Publishing Co., 1993), 285. Hereinafter cited as Shuck, *Greenbrier County Death Records*. ("Phoebe White born NY, died 9 May 1866 age 75y father Geo Whitman mother Phebe Whitman; rpt Ann Sydenstricker, daughter; cause Dropsy; Vol. 1A")

<sup>8</sup> Greenbrier Deeds, book 1, page 347, County Clerk, Lewisburg, WV: FHL microfilm number 593544. (Purchaser recorded as Feebe Whitman.) This town survey could be either Lewisburg or Frankfort both of which had been settled by this time. However, Tax list evidence suggested that it was the Lewisburg town settlement that was intended.

<sup>9</sup> Phebey Whitman, 1794 Greenbrier County year Personal property tax lists, James Rodgers district, unpaginated, Virginia State Library, Richmond, VA: FHL microfilm numbers 2024557. (Quality is poor, often filmed white on black, binding has damaged some entries.) Hereinafter cited as Greenbrier personal property tax lists.

<sup>10</sup> Feby Whitman, Greenbrier County, 1794 Land Book, unpaginated, Virginia State Library, Richmond, VA: FHL microfilm numbers 0466748. (Filmed from photostatic copies, at WV State Auditors Office, Photostats taken 9 September 1958. Quality is poor, very dark copies and hard to read at times.) Hereinafter cited as Greenbrier land books. (The notation "assignee of Wm. Welch is a key to tracking the property in 1796 when Phoebe's name disappears from the land books.)

Welch from 1795-1801 but the first name of this individual is difficult to read and appears to be Judah (see discussion of Judah Whitman on page 10) Phoebe continues to appear on the personal property tax lists between 1796-1802. She is charged with a varying number of tithables, probably as her sons reach age 16 and then move onto the rolls under their own name at age 21.<sup>11</sup> In 1800, Mrs. Phebey (*sic*) Whitman purchases a horse from the estate of John Hollingsworth.<sup>12</sup> In 1801 she appears again on the land tax lists but as “Widow” Whitman.<sup>13</sup>

On 2 October 1802, Pheba (*sic*) Whitman sold the land she had purchased in 1793. On the same day she purchased 123 acres on the waters of Anthony’s Creek from Israel Holly and his wife Mary.<sup>14</sup> This purchase was critical in the future of the Whitman family. The farm established with this purchase gave the family name to a branch of Anthony’s Creek<sup>15</sup> and members of the family remained on Whitman’s Draft until at least the 1960s.<sup>16</sup>

Phoebe Whitman married Robert Buckhannon<sup>17</sup>, a Revolutionary War veteran from Orange County, NY on 28 August 1803.<sup>18</sup> She never again appears in the record by name. However, she is undoubtedly the “wife who is 69 or 70 years of age, who is so very old and debilitated as to be unable to assist herself or cook her own victuals” mentioned in Robert Buckhannon’s pension deposition of 23 August 1820.<sup>19</sup> The age given in this deposition gives Phoebe a probable birth year of 1750.

This pension deposition makes a curious statement that would seem to indicate some form of pre-nuptial agreement between Phoebe Whitman and Robert Buckhannon. Buckhannon states that “he has not disposed of any of his property to diminish it to bring himself within the provisions of an Act of Congress”<sup>20</sup> and the list of property appended includes no land and only the most meager of household goods.<sup>21</sup> Yet between 1804 and 1820 Robert Buckhannon paid tax on 123 acres “received of the Widow Whitman.”<sup>22</sup> He continued to pay tax on this land until 1829 when it appeared on the tax rolls under the name of William Whitman.<sup>23</sup> No deed has been found recording this transfer of land. In his 1835 will Robert Buckhannon mentions no wife or children and leaves no real estate.<sup>24</sup> It is then reasonable to conclude that the 1829 change in the land tax lists reflects the death of Phoebe (?) Whitman

---

<sup>11</sup> Greenbrier personal property tax lists. Pheby Whitman 1796 19 April, 1 Tithable 1 horse; Phebe Whitman 1800 23 April, 2 tithables 1 horse; Whitman, widdaw, 1802 B list\ 2 tithables 2 horses.

<sup>12</sup> Larry G. Shuck, *Greenbrier County, [W] Virginia Records, Vol. V* (Athens, GA: Iberian Publishing Co., 1993), page 159. (John Hollingsworth estate settlement 2 May 1800.)

<sup>13</sup> Whitman, widow, 1801 Greenbrier land books. (Assessed for 75 acres, assignee of Wm. Welch.)

<sup>14</sup> Greenbrier Deeds, book 2, page 551, County Clerk, Lewisburg, WV: FHL microfilm number 593544. (Deed states 70 acres but she was taxed on 75 acres in 1796-1801.)

<sup>15</sup> US Department of the Interior, Geographical Survey, Topographical Map: West Virginia, Anthony’s Creek Quadrangle; 7.5’ Series (topographic) revised 1981.

<sup>16</sup> *Cooper’s History*, 5.

<sup>17</sup> Robert Buckhannon appears in the Greenbrier County records as Buchanon, Buckhannon and Buchannon. I have standardized to the most commons spelling.

<sup>18</sup> Greenbrier Marriage Records, 1A: 11.

<sup>19</sup> Helen S. Stinson, compiler *Greenbrier County, W. Virginia, Court Orders, 1780-1850, transcribed and indexed* (Moorpark, CA: privately published, 1988), page 313. Hereinafter cited as Stinson, *Greenbrier County Court Orders*. Also Robert Buchanon Pension File, S37806, National Archives Micropublication M805, roll 136, 11 pages.

<sup>20</sup> Stinson, *Greenbrier County Court Orders*, 313

<sup>21</sup> Stinson, *Greenbrier County Court Orders*, 313

<sup>22</sup> Buchannon, Robert, 1819 Greenbrier land book A, Anthony’s Creek District, unpaginated.

<sup>23</sup> Wm. Whitman, 1829 Greenbrier land book A. (For the past 27 years this land had been charged to Robert Buckhannon as assignee of Widow Whitman.) Anthony’s Creek District, unpaginated.

<sup>24</sup> Will of Robert Buckhannon, Pocahontas County Will Book 1, page 475, case #96, Clerk of the Courts Office, Marlinton, WV: FHL microfilm 0804485. (Will of Robert Buckhannon, probated September Court 1836 9, written 24 March 1835.) Hereinafter *Buckhannon Will*, Pocahontas County.

Buckhannon, and that at her death her land, protected for her children by a pre-nuptial agreement, passed to her surviving children William Whitman and Phoebe Whitman White.

In summary, Phoebe (?) Whitman Buckhannon, born circa 1750, was old enough to have children of marriageable age in 1797. She had males of tithable age living in her household between 1796 and 1802, before her marriage to Robert Buckhannon. And she had purchased and was apparently farming 123 acres in the Anthony's Creek area of Greenbrier County by 1802. The question then is – which of the seven Whitman adults found in early Greenbrier County records are children of Phoebe. The candidates proposed by *Cooper's History* and the *Whitman History* are Julia, Ann, George, Andrew, William, Holly and the younger Phoebe Whitman who married, in the order listed, in Greenbrier County between 1797 and 1815. In addition, 2 other Whitman adults (Richard and Juddah), of an age to be children or relatives of Phoebe, were discovered during this research.

## The Potential Whitman Children

**Julia Whitman Foglesong** - Julia Whitman married Christopher Foglesong on 9 March 1797.<sup>25</sup>

Personal property tax lists for the period 1793-1802 indicate that Christopher and Phoebe Whitman were usually visited at about the same time.<sup>26</sup> Presumably they were neighbors. In 1802, when Phoebe sold her land near town Christopher Foglesong witnessed the deed.<sup>27</sup> The census schedule for 1820 places Christopher's household in Frankfort the town where Thomas Masters, husband of Ann Whitman, was living.<sup>28</sup> In 1833 when Christopher sold his town lots, Julia did not release her dower rights.<sup>29</sup> There is no record of a further land purchase and Christopher temporarily disappears from the census in 1840. In 1850 Christopher, but not Julia, is enumerated in the household of William Foglesong.<sup>30</sup> Julia Whitman Foglesong probably died before the 1833 land sale. Christopher and Julia named a daughter Phoebe and sons George and William, all names taken from the Whitman families of Greenbrier County. Phoebe and William are not common names in German families of this period and the names George, Phoebe and William do not appear in the proposed German ancestry of Christopher Foglesong.<sup>31</sup>

In addition to the evidence linking Christopher Foglesong and Phoebe Whitman there are several connections between the next generation of Foglesongs and various Whitman descendants.

Three daughters of Julia Whitman Foglesong married men surnamed Kerr/Carr. Julia's oldest daughter Elizabeth married Thomas Kerr on 22 April 1828.<sup>32</sup> When Robert Buckhannon removed from the Whitman land in 1829, he appears to have taken-up residence with Elizabeth and Thomas Kerr. In 1830 he is probably the male aged over 70 living in the household of Thomas Kerr.<sup>33</sup> He apparently moved with them to Pocahontas County where he was living when his will was written and probated.

---

<sup>25</sup> Greenbrier Marriage Records Book 1A: 97.

<sup>26</sup> 1794-1802 Greenbrier personal property tax lists.

<sup>27</sup> Greenbrier Deeds, book 2, page 551.

<sup>28</sup> Thomas "Mastes" Household, 1820 U.S. Census, Greenbrier County, Virginia, Frankfort, page 79; Christopher Foglesong Household, 1820 U.S. Census, Greenbrier County, Virginia, Frankfort, page 73; National Archives micro publication M33, roll 132.

<sup>29</sup> Greenbrier Deeds, book 12, page 567.

<sup>30</sup> William Foglesong Household, 1850 U.S. Census, Greenbrier County, Virginia, population schedule, District 18, page 241, dwelling 99, family 99; National Archives micro publication M432, roll 947.

<sup>31</sup> James Stanton Foglesong, *Descendants of Christopher Foglesong*, manuscript copy sent to me by descendant Paul Murray, dated 20 April 1999.

<sup>32</sup> Greenbrier Marriage Records, Book 1A: 73.

<sup>33</sup> Thomas Kerr Household, 1830 U.S. Census, Greenbrier County, Virginia, page 185; National Archives micro publication M19, roll 190. The fathers of Thomas Kerr and Elizabeth Foglesong are accounted for elsewhere in Greenbrier County in 1830.

Buckhannon names “my good friends” Elizabeth and Thomas as residual legatees in his 1835 will and names Thomas Kerr as executor.<sup>34</sup> Thomas Kerr also signed the 1836 bond for Julia Ann Whitman’s marriage to James Harvey Cooper in Pocahontas County.<sup>35</sup> Julia Ann was the daughter of George Whitman and Elizabeth Rodgers.<sup>36</sup> The presumption is that he was her guardian, although no records have been found confirming this. And in 1853, Phoebe Foglesong Kerr and John Foglesong, second son of Christopher and Julia, signed a quitclaim deed with the heirs of George Whitman jr. in 1853.<sup>37</sup> (For further discussion of this deed see George Whitman material below.)

**Ann Whitman Masters** - Ann Whitman married Thomas Masters on 9 March 1797 in Greenbrier County.<sup>38</sup>

An undocumented Masters family article asserts that Thomas Masters was the son of Richard Masters of Orange County, New York, Greenbrier County, Virginia, and Kentucky.<sup>39</sup> The 1790 census for Warwick, Orange County, New York shows Richard Masters residing next to George Whitman.<sup>40</sup> From 1800-1812 Thomas Masters and Christopher Foglesong appear near each other on the tax list of “town lots” in the Lewisburg District.<sup>41</sup> In 1806, Thomas Masters and wife Ann sold 150 acres on Howard’s Creek.<sup>42</sup> This is Ann’s last known appearance in the records of Greenbrier County. A woman of the correct age to be Ann appears in the Thomas Masters household on the 1820 census.<sup>43</sup> Ann Whitman Masters died between the taking of the 1820 census and 26 December 1822 when Thomas married Francis (Cox) Wickline.<sup>44</sup>

There is no direct evidence linking Thomas and Ann Masters’ children to any of the Whitman families. The families appear to have lived in different parts of the county after 1820. Naming patterns are difficult to evaluate, as there is no agreement among researchers on the names and number of the Masters children. Thomas and Ann likely had a son named George. Thomas and his second wife named a daughter Julia Ann.<sup>45</sup> In addition there are children recorded on the census for Thomas and Ann whose names are unknown.

---

<sup>34</sup> *Buckhannon Will*, Pocahontas County.

<sup>35</sup> *Cooper’s History*, page 5.

<sup>36</sup> *Cooper’s History*, page 5.

<sup>37</sup> Greenbrier Deeds, book 28, page 347. (This deed was signed 10 years after the final settling of George Whitman’s estate and no reason is given why John Foglesong and the Kerrs were parties to the deed. Perhaps they were the guardians for the minor heirs of John R. Whitman, son of George Whitman and Elizabeth Rodgers, who had died in 1849.)

<sup>38</sup> Greenbrier Marriages, 1A: 89.

<sup>39</sup> Tim Masters, “Thomas Masters Family,” in *Greenbrier County, West Virginia Family Heritage Book*, Greenbrier County Heritage Book Committee, editor (Lewisburg, WV: Greenbrier County, the Committee, 1997), 140.

<sup>40</sup> George Whitman Household, 1790 U.S. Census, Warwick Township, Orange County, New York, page 397, line 1674; National Archives micro publication M637, roll 5. (The Whitman and Masters families were part of a larger migration of families from Orange County through Pennsylvania, where some family members stayed, into Greenbrier County and eventually to southern Ohio and eastern Kentucky. Other family names appearing together in all these areas are Holly, Shepard, Kincaid, Bailey, Rodgers, Rhoads, Knap(p) and Buckhannon.)

<sup>41</sup> Christopher Foglesong and Thomas Masters, 1800-1805 Greenbrier land books, unpaginated. (Books are roughly alphabetized during this period.)

<sup>42</sup> Greenbrier Deeds, 3:410. FHL microfilm 0594288.

<sup>43</sup> 1820 U.S. census, Greenbrier County, Virginia population schedule, Lewisburg, p. 185 (handwritten upper left corner), line 5, Thomas Masters; digital images, *Ancestry* ([www.ancestry.com](http://www.ancestry.com)); citing National Archives and Records Administration microfilm M33, roll 132.

<sup>44</sup> Greenbrier Marriage Records, Book 1A: 92. (The marriage record says Thomas Martin. However, an 1835 deed shows clearly that the Thomas who married Francis Wickline Cox was Thomas Masters. *Greenbrier Deeds*, 14: 65)

<sup>45</sup> Campbell, Betty Masters *et al*, *The Masters Family Genealogy and History* (Dardanelle, AK: privately published, 198?), 17. My research indicates that there were at least 3 sons and 2 daughters of Thomas and Ann Masters. I used land and tax records to connect several Masters individuals, married in Greenbrier County between 1807-1825 to Thomas and Ann Masters. However, Campbell gives them only 1 son and 1 daughter. The Campbell book is undocumented.

**George Whitman** - George Whitman married Elizabeth Rodgers on 17 May 1804.<sup>46</sup>

In 1804 George Whitman appears by name on the property tax lists for the first time. His name appears beneath Robert Buckhannon and near that of Israel Holly, establishing him in the Anthony's Creek neighborhood.<sup>47</sup> In 1805 he appears between Robert Buckhannon and William Whitman.<sup>48</sup> Also in 1805, George buys land from Moses Shepard, son in law of Israel Holly. This land adjoins the Phoebe Whitman purchase of 1802 and the farm of Israel Holly.<sup>49</sup>

George died between 23 March 1824 (the date of the tax list for that year) and 16 March 1825 when Elizabeth Whitman, widow, paid the taxes on the land purchased in 1805 and paid taxes for 3 males of tithable age.<sup>50</sup> Elizabeth may have been named administrator of George's estate and guardian of her 10 minor children, but no record has been found of that action. Elizabeth paid the taxes on the land and for a varying number of tithable males in 1826 and 1827.<sup>51</sup> Elizabeth Rodgers Whitman apparently died in late 1827 or early 1828, as she disappears at that time from the tax lists and there is no evidence of a remarriage. On 2 June 1828, William Whitman became the guardian of Jesse and John S. Whitman, two of the minor sons of George and Elizabeth.<sup>52</sup> At the same time William is named administrator of George's estate and takes over payment of all taxes on the estate.<sup>53</sup> The evidence is strong that the William Whitman in these legal transactions is a brother of George and not George's son named William. (For further discussion of this see the section on William Whitman.) In his 1835 will, Robert Buckhannon gave a legacy to Jesse Whitman, son of George and Elizabeth Whitman "the boy I raised."<sup>54</sup>

In 1853 the heirs of George Whitman signed a quitclaim deed on the property George Whitman had purchased in 1805.<sup>55</sup> Among the signers of this deed were John and Mary Foglesong, James and Phoebe Kerr, and James and Phoebe White. While all these individuals were related to George Whitman, they were not all his heirs. In fact, they are related to George in different degrees, with James and Phoebe White being his sister and brother-in law and the others being his nieces and nephews. The most likely explanation is that James and Phoebe White signed to quiet title to the land (see discussion under Phoebe Whitman the younger.) John Foglesong and James Kerr may have been either representatives of the heirs who did not sign the deed or they were the guardians of the minor children of James Whitman, a recently deceased heir to the estate. No power of attorneys or guardianship papers for James Whitman's children have been found so all these scenarios remain speculation.

---

<sup>46</sup> Greenbrier Marriage Records, 1A: 160. (George appears to have married much younger than his siblings. The reason is probably connected to the birth in either late 1804 or early 1805 of Andrew M Whitman, their first child.)

<sup>47</sup> George Whitman, 1804, Greenbrier personal property tax lists B, unpaginated. (George Whitman, 1 tithable, 1 horse.)

<sup>48</sup> Ibid, 1805, List B: unpaginated.

<sup>49</sup> Greenbrier Deeds, 3: 312. (The seller is Moses Shepard son-in-law of Israel Holly. The legal description of the land on this deed is an almost exact match for the legal description in a deed between David Holly and James White dated November 1815. The seller in the second deed is the son of Israel Holly.)

<sup>50</sup> Elizabeth Whitman, widow, 16 March 1825 Greenbrier personal property tax lists, Samuel Kincaid District. (The three males are probably Andrew age 19/20, William age 18/19 and George the younger age 16/17. Some branches of this family were much more fecund than others!)

<sup>51</sup> Elizabeth Whitman widow, March 1826 Greenbrier personal property tax lists, Samuel Kincaid District: George Whitman (sic), 1826 Greenbrier land books A, roughly alphabetized: Elizabeth Whitman widow, 16 March 1827 Greenbrier personal property tax lists, Samuel Kincaid District: George Whitman (sic), 1827 Greenbrier land books A, roughly alphabetized.

<sup>52</sup> Stinson, *Greenbrier County Court Orders*, 336.

<sup>53</sup> Ibid, 334. (There should be guardianship records for at least 6 other children, but these have not been found in the court records of Greenbrier County, to date.)

<sup>54</sup> Buckhannon Will, Pocahontas County

<sup>55</sup> Greenbrier Deeds, 28: 347.

George and Elizabeth Whitman named several of their children after his family - sons George, William and Holly and daughter Julia Ann.<sup>56</sup> Son John R. may have been named for Elizabeth Rodgers Whitman's father.<sup>57</sup> Phoebe's name is conspicuous in its absence.

**William Whitman** - William Whitman married Elizabeth Erwin, daughter of James and Sarah (?) Erwin on 2 April 1807.<sup>58</sup>

In the *Whitman History* William's birth date is given as 9 March 1779,<sup>59</sup> Cooper also gives him a birth year of 1779.<sup>60</sup> The birth year is confirmed by William's age of 71 on the 1850 Census.<sup>61</sup> William is one of only two possible Whitman siblings to be mentioned in a published biographical source.<sup>62</sup> That biography gives his place of birth as Orange County, New York, thereby implying that the traditional origin of the family was common knowledge in the 1880s. William's daughter Elizabeth Whitman Kerr's 1880 census entry also lists her father's birthplace as New York.

In 1796 Phoba (*sic*) Whitman appears on the property tax lists of Greenbrier County for the 2<sup>nd</sup> time. On this list she pays tax for 1 male and is taxed for 1 horse.<sup>63</sup> The tithable male is undoubtedly the 16/17 year-old William. Between 1796 and 1800 Phoebe pays taxes for only 1 tithable, presumably in each case William.<sup>64</sup> Following normal patterns we would expect to see William appear under his own name in 1801 or 1802. Instead, in 1802, Phoebe Whitman pays tax for 2 polls, George, aged about 16 and William near 21.<sup>65</sup> William does not appear under his own name until 1805, at which time he is listed beneath Robert Buckhannon on the Anthony's Creek district list.<sup>66</sup> He remained on the Anthony's Creek list, between Robert Buckhannon and George Whitman until 1812, when he and his young family apparently moved into Lewisburg. From 1812-1815 William is listed on the Lewisburg district Personal Property Tax lists.<sup>67</sup> Since his occupation was shoemaker in the 1850 census perhaps, he was apprenticing and living with his master in town during this time.<sup>68</sup> He is back on the Anthony's Creek lists by 1816.<sup>69</sup>

No land purchase has been found for William. However, on the 1829 Land tax list he is credited with the acreage previously charged to Robert Buckhannon as assignee of Widow Whitman.<sup>70</sup> He is taxed on this

---

<sup>56</sup> *Cooper's History*, 2-3.

<sup>57</sup> Larry G. Shuck, *Greenbrier County, [W] Virginia Records, vol. 1*, 243. "Court for August 1800...Wm Rodgers and Ann, orphans of John Rodgers, dec'd, made choice of John Young for guardian, also Elizabeth, Mary Rodgers."

<sup>58</sup> *Greenbrier Marriages*, 1A: 160.

<sup>59</sup> *Whitman History*, 1.

<sup>60</sup> *Cooper's History*, 1.

<sup>61</sup> William Whitman Household, 1850 U.S. Census, Greenbrier County, Virginia, population schedule, District 18, page 329, dwelling 1311, family 1311; National Archives micro publication M432, roll 947. Hereinafter William Whitman Household, 1850 U.S. Census.

<sup>62</sup> William T. Price, *Historical Sketches of Pocahontas County*, Price Brothers, Marlinton, 1901, page 378.

<sup>63</sup> Pheby Whitman, 19 April 1796 Greenbrier personal property tax lists, unpaginated.

<sup>64</sup> Greenbrier personal property tax lists, Pheby Whitman, 30 May 1797; Phebe Whitman, 21 April 1798, James Hanna's List; Phebe Whitman, 3 May 1799; Phebe Whitman, 23 April 1800.

<sup>65</sup> Whitman, widow, 1805 Greenbrier personal property tax lists B, unpaginated, roughly alphabetized. (*The arrangement of the names makes it clear that the copied list preserves the original order in which the names were written as they were visited. For example, in 1805 Whitman, widow appears immediately above Whitman, George, White James and Wylie Rankin. Were this a strictly alphabetized list these names would not appear in this order.*)

<sup>66</sup> William Whitman, 11 May 1805, Greenbrier personal property tax lists B, Anthony's Creek district, unpaginated.

<sup>67</sup> William Whitman, various dates 1812-1815 Greenbrier personal property tax lists A, unpaginated. (This is the same list where Chris. Foglesong and Thomas Masters appear during these years.)

<sup>68</sup> William Whitman Household, 1850 U.S. Census, Greenbrier.

<sup>69</sup> William Whitman, 1816 Greenbrier personal property tax lists B, unpaginated.

<sup>70</sup> William Whitman, 1829 Greenbrier land books A, Anthony's Creek district, alphabetized. (Robert Buckhannon is no longer on land list or property tax list.)

land until his death in 1852.<sup>71 72</sup> Presumably in 1829, he inherited at least a part of the lands purchased by Phoebe Whitman in 1802. They appear to have been secured to him by an unrecorded prenuptial agreement between Phoebe and Robert Buckhannon.

Many other records tie William and his family to other descendants of Phoebe Whitman. William's daughter Elizabeth married David Kerr,<sup>73</sup> a half-brother of the Kerr husbands of the Foglesong daughters. Land tax records make it clear that, the William who was named administrator of the estate of George Whitman, was not George's son William but rather his brother. From 1830 to at least 1850 William Whitman also pays the taxes on 3 parcels of land, his own two and that previously charged to the estate of George Whitman.<sup>74</sup> At the same time on the property tax lists William Whitman sr. and William Whitman jr. are listed together on the Anthony's Creek district list.<sup>75</sup>

Finally, William named many of his children after family members. He named sons, James Erwin (after his father-in-law), George W., William Franklin (after himself and perhaps a son of Ann Whitman Masters) and Holly. He named daughters after his mother Phoebe, his wife Elizabeth, his mother-in-law Sarah, and his sisters Julia Ann.<sup>76</sup>

**Andrew Whitman** - Andrew married Elizabeth Prince on 12 November 1808 in Greenbrier Co.<sup>77</sup>

There has been no documentary evidence uncovered connecting Andrew Whitman to Phoebe Whitman or any of her offspring. Greenbrier tax and court records indicate that Andrew was of legal age by 1792 when he first appears on the personal property tax lists.<sup>78</sup> In 1793 Andrew Whitman witnessed the will of Martin Henry Shoals<sup>79</sup> and in 1818 he testified as to the validity of a translation from "the Dutch" of the will of Michael Hawyer.<sup>80</sup> Tax records from 1796-1818 place Andrew's land (no purchase record has been found) in the Levels, on the opposite side of the county from the Anthony's Creek.<sup>81</sup> By 1820 Andrew Whitman appears on the census in Wythe Co.<sup>82</sup> In *History of Virginia*, there is brief undocumented genealogy of the Whitman family of Wythe County, Virginia including their descent from one Andreas Whitman of Germany, Pennsylvania, Greenbrier and Wythe Counties.<sup>83</sup> Only one piece of evidence offers a slight connection between Andrew Whitman and the Christopher Foglesong family. In

---

<sup>71</sup> William Whitman, 1852 Greenbrier personal property tax lists A, Anthony's creek district, alphabetized.

<sup>72</sup> Estate sale of William Whitman, Greenbrier County Will Book 3, page 605, Clerk of the Courts Office, Greenbrier County Courthouse, Lewisburg, WV: FHL microfilm 0595215. (List of personal property sold by Thomas A Bell [administrator] of Wm Whitman, dec'd This 7<sup>th</sup> October 1852.)

<sup>73</sup> Greenbrier Marriages, 1A: 74.

<sup>74</sup> William Whitman, 1830 Greenbrier land books A. (William is charged with 3 parcels of land, including 1 of 77 acres. This is the parcel that George Whitman purchased from Moses Shepard in 1805.)

<sup>75</sup> William Whitman, sr., 1829 Greenbrier personal property tax lists, Mason Mathews district, 9 March 1829. (William Whitman, jr. is listed below William Whitman sr.)

<sup>76</sup> "Descendants of William Whitman," E-mail from Linda Link Whitman to the author, 28 December 2000. (Linda is a descendant of William Whitman and Elizabeth Ervin.)

<sup>77</sup> Greenbrier Marriages, 1A: 161.

<sup>78</sup> Andrew Whitman, 1792 Greenbrier personal property tax lists, William Ward District, unpaginated.

<sup>79</sup> Larry G. Shuck, *Greenbrier County, [W] Virginia Records, Vol. I*, (Athens, GA: Iberian Publishing Co., 1993), 205. (This is volume is a compilation of early survey records and early court records.)

<sup>80</sup> Ibid, 251. ("An instrument of writing (written in Dutch) purporting to be the last Will and Testament of Michael Hawyer, presented ....and a translation in English, was also produced in court and proved by George Whitzell and Andrew Whitman to be correctly translated...").

<sup>81</sup> Andrew Whitman, 1800 Greenbrier land books, James Hanna's district, unpaginated.

<sup>82</sup> Andrew Whitman Household, 1820 U.S. Census, Evanshaw Township, Wythe County, Virginia, page 226, line 13; National Archives micro publication M33, roll 139.

<sup>83</sup> *History of Virginia, volume 6 "Virginia Biography"*, (Chicago, IL: American Historical Society, 1924), 6:473. "John Alexander Whitman Biographical Sketch."



1842, George D. Foglesong, youngest known son of Christopher and Julia married Martha Whetzel<sup>84</sup> and they are living in the household of George Whetzel in 1850.<sup>85</sup> In 1818 a George Whetzel attested, along with Andrew Whitman, to the accuracy of the translation of Michael Hawyer's will. The only other evidence of a connection is that George Whitman named his oldest known son Andrew M. Whitman, c. 1805. These two pieces of evidence do not seem strong enough to outweigh the biographical article and court evidence giving a German origin for Andrew Whitman. This connection can be explained by the tendency for immigrants of similar background, in this case German ancestry, to form social and marital connections.

**Holly Whitman** - Holly Whitman married Sally (Sarah) Ervin, daughter of James and Sarah (?) Erwin (and sister to Elizabeth, wife of William Whitman)<sup>86</sup> on 15 April 1811.<sup>87</sup>

In 1809 and 1810 Robert Buckhannon paid tax for 2 males, himself, and Holly Whitman age 18-20.<sup>88</sup> In 1811, shortly before his marriage, Holly appeared as Holey (*sic*) Whitman on the Anthony's Creek tax lists between Robert Buckhannon and George Whitman. On 27 November 1817 Holly Whitman entered 55 acres on Sims Run a branch of Anthony's Creek, part of warrant belonging to James Erwin.<sup>89</sup> Holly's last appearance on the Personal Property Tax list is 12 April 1819.<sup>90</sup> In 1820 he appears on the land tax lists for Jackson County, Ohio.<sup>91</sup> He died between August 1825 when he was an election clerk in Jackson County and September 1825 when an administrator was appointed for his estate.<sup>92</sup>

**Phoebe Whitman the younger** Phoebe Whitman married James White on 6 November 1815.<sup>93</sup>

Of all the proposed children of Phoebe Whitman only Phoebe the younger has an official record directly connecting her to the names, George and Phoebe Whitman. However, death records are notoriously unreliable for the names of the deceased's parents. And in this case, the event, in 1866, was reported by Phoebe's daughter Mary Ann White Sydensticker and occurred at least 36 years after the death of Phoebe Whitman senior.<sup>94</sup> Mary Ann could have had only a young child's memories of her grandmother and never knew her grandfather.

---

<sup>84</sup> West Virginia Marriages, 1780-1970, database, FamilySearch (<https://www.familysearch.org/ark:/61903/1:1:Q2ZF-HBHM> : 12 September 2020), George D Foglesong and Martha Wetzal, 25 Nov 1842; citing Marriage, Greenbrier, West Virginia, United States, county clerks, West Virginia; FHL microfilm.

<sup>85</sup> George Whetzel Household, 1850 Federal Census, Greenbrier County, population schedule, District 18, page 268, dwelling 454; National Archives micro publication M432, roll 947.

<sup>86</sup> Will of James Ervin, Greenbrier County Will Book 1, page 791, Clerk of the Courts Office, Greenbrier County Courthouse, Lewisburg, WV: FHL microfilm 0595215. *The Erwin name appears as Irwin, Irvin, Erwin and Ervin in Greenbrier County records.*

<sup>87</sup> Greenbrier Marriages, 1A: 162.

<sup>88</sup> Robert Buckhannon, 1809 and 1810 Greenbrier personal property tax lists B, unpaginated. *On both lists the entry is "Robert Buckhannon 2 tithables, 3 horses."*

<sup>89</sup> Holly Whitman, Greenbrier Land Entry Records, Book 5 page 62, Clerk of the County Court, Lewisburg, WV: FHL microfilm number 0594454. (Holly Whitman enters 55 acres by part of a warrant for 700 acres No 6094 dated 27 Nov. 1817 assigned by James Erwin, to be on Sims Run, a branch of Anthony's Creek.) *Although Holly entered the warrant, he appears to have never taken up the land surveyed.*

<sup>90</sup> Holly Whitman, 2 April 1819 Greenbrier personal property tax lists B, unpaginated. (Entry is between William Whitman and George Whitman.)

<sup>91</sup> Holly Whitman entry, 1820 Jackson County Tax Duplicates, Volume 670, page 3, State Auditors Office, Columbus, OH: FHL microfilm 0493566. *"Whitman, Holly acres 83, R17T9S30SE original owner Andrew Crouch."*

<sup>92</sup> Holly Whitman, case #49 26 September 1825, Jackson County, General and judgment index, estate, guardianships assignments, trusts, Book A: page 44. Office of the Clerk of the Probate Courts, Jackson, OH: FHL microfilm 0301054. *"Whitman, Holly, admin. Samuel Carick case #49, 26 September 1825, book A page 44." This is an index entry only. FHL has not filmed probate books and Jackson County Probate Clerk has not responded to query as of January 2020.*

<sup>93</sup> Greenbrier Marriages, 1A: 162.

<sup>94</sup> Shuck, *Greenbrier County Death Records*, 285.

Many records connect Phoebe Whitman White to the other Whitman families of the Anthony's Creek area. James White, Phoebe's husband was an adjoining landowner to Phoebe Whitman senior and purchased some of his land from Israel Holly's son David as did George Whitman.<sup>95</sup> In addition, James Erwin, father of Elizabeth and Sally Erwin Whitman entered land on Anthony's Creek jointly with a James White on 29 October 1817.<sup>96</sup> Numerous property and land tax lists place James White as a neighbor of Robert Buckhannon, William Whitman, George Whitman and Israel Holly on neighboring drafts of Anthony's Creek.<sup>97 98</sup> Whitman's Draft (site of the 1802 Phoebe Whitman land purchase and the 1805 purchase by George Whitman) is immediately south of White's Draft.<sup>99</sup> In fact, descendants of this couple still occupy the White farm on White's draft.<sup>100</sup>

James and Phoebe White were signers, along with George Whitman's heirs, of the quitclaim deed of 1853.<sup>101</sup> James and Phoebe may have signed this deed in an attempt to quiet the title to the land, since it appears from deeds dated 1805<sup>102</sup> and 1815<sup>103</sup> that the land David Holly sold to James White in 1815 was at least partly the same as the land Moses Shepard sold to George Whitman in 1805 (The legal descriptions of the property are nearly identical. The 1805 deed reads S28 degrees E38 poles then S87 degrees W 37 poles: the 1815 deed reads S16 degrees E38 poles then S31 degrees W 37 poles. If a copying error accounted for the S87/S31 degrees difference, then the two deeds vary by only one measurement. That is certainly close enough to open the issue to a lawsuit.)

Phoebe and James White named their oldest son George and youngest daughter Phoebe, but these and their other children's names could have come equally from the White family naming traditions. The Whites were a numerous family in Greenbrier County and frequently repeated the names James, George, William, and Robert in each generation.

## Two Other Adult Whitmans Appearing in the Records of Greenbrier County

**Richard Whitman** - A Richard Whitman appears in the earliest records of Greenbrier County In 1782 he filed several land entry surveys based on state patents.<sup>104</sup> He paid taxes for 1 tithable male in 1788 and 1789.<sup>105</sup> Richard was awarded a bounty in March 1785 for "an old wolf head."<sup>106</sup> After the 1789 tax list Richard Whitman disappeared from the records of Greenbrier County. This individual is most probably the Revolutionary War veteran Richard Whitman who was born in Culpepper County, Virginia, lived in Virginia for "some years" and died in Kentucky according to his pension file.<sup>107</sup> There is no evidence

---

<sup>95</sup> Greenbrier Deeds, 6: 122.

<sup>96</sup> James Erwin and James White, Greenbrier Land Entry Records, Book 5 page 57, Clerk of the County Court, Lewisburg, WV: FHL microfilm number 0594454. ("James Erwin and James White, warrant No 6062 for 1500 acres dated 29 October 1817...both parcels to be on Anthony's Creek.")

<sup>97</sup> James White, 1794-1815 Greenbrier personal property tax lists, various collectors' names, unpaginated, usually roughly alphabetized.

<sup>98</sup> James White, 1803-1829 Greenbrier land books B, Anthony's Creek district, unpaginated.

<sup>99</sup> US Department of the Interior, Geographical Survey, Topographical Map: West Virginia, Anthony's Creek Quadrangle; 7.5' Series (topographic) revised 1981.

<sup>100</sup> "Family still in Alvon area." E-mail from Linda Link Whitman to the author 15 December 2000.

<sup>101</sup> Greenbrier Deeds, 20: 229.

<sup>102</sup> Greenbrier Deeds, 3:312.

<sup>103</sup> Greenbrier Deeds, 6:122.

<sup>104</sup> Richard Whitman, Greenbrier Land Entry Records, Book 1 page 199, 29 July 1785, Clerk of the County Court, Lewisburg, WV: FHL microfilm number 0594454. (Entry for 400 acres, by State Warrant dated 1782. "to begin at a spring on the flat mountains between Lick Creek and Laurel Creek")

<sup>105</sup> Richard Whitman, 1788 Greenbrier personal property tax lists, p.13 and 1789 Greenbrier personal property tax lists, p. 11.

<sup>106</sup> Stinson, *Greenbrier County Court Orders*, 109.

<sup>107</sup> Virgil White, *Abstracts of Revolutionary War Pension File* (Waynesboro, TN: The National Historical Publishing Company, 1992), 4:3810.

connecting him to the Phoebe Whitman family and no evidence that they were even in the county during the same period.

**Judah Whitman** - This individual's existence is problematic. Only the Greenbrier land tax books give any evidence of this name between 1797-1800.<sup>108</sup> During those 4 years a Judah Whitman is taxed for the land previously charged to Phoebe Whitman between 1793-1796, and that will again be charged to Widow Whitman in 1802-1803 and then charged to Robert Buckhannon from 1803-1829.

There are at least 3 theories that could account for the presence of this individual –

- 1) This is a mistake for Widow Whitman or a badly written Phoebe Whitman. In favor of this theory is the fact that Phoebe was also found as Febe, Pheba and Feba all of which appear to be phonetic renderings of the name. Widow, based on the various spellings seen in the record, appears to have been pronounced "widah." Also in favor of this possibility is the condition of the original records from the period, which are full of phonetic spellings and oddly spelled first names as well as being age darkened and hard to read. Working against this theory is the consistent use of Phoebe (in various spellings) Whitman in the personal property tax lists of the same period.
- 2) Judah was the husband of Phoebe Whitman who joined the family in Greenbrier County after 1795. However, during this period Phoebe Whitman continues to pay the taxes for the tithables in her household and she bought a horse from the estate of a neighbor. Both activities are unlikely to have taken place under Phoebe's name if there were a husband in the family.
- 3) Judah Whitman was a previously unidentified older son of Phoebe Whitman who either died or moved out of the area before he married. This hypothesis has in its favor the appearance on the scene, circa 1801, of Robert Buckhannon, soon to be the stepfather of the Whitman children. Perhaps there was friction between the adult son and the suitor. However, there are major problems with this theory. The personal property tax lists never mention Judah Whitman, as they should if he were acting as the head of the household. Also, correlation of the tithables credited to Phoebe Whitman and then to Robert Buckhannon does not reveal an adult male who is not accounted for by the entry on to the lists by first William, then George, and finally Holly Whitman. The existing evidence exactly fits Phoebe's proposed sons and there are no anomalies. Finally, a careful check of several national and regional indexes for the period 1800-1820 turns up no individual named Judah Whitman residing elsewhere in the country.<sup>109</sup>

In the absence of compelling evidence for the alternatives, it is likely Judah is a mistake for either Phoebe or Widow Whitman.

---

<sup>108</sup>Judah Whitman, 1797-1800 Greenbrier land books, James Hanna District, unpaginated. (All entries read "Judah Whitman, assignee of Wm. Welch, 70 acres." This is the same entry as Phoebe Whitman's entry in 1796.)

<sup>109</sup>Ronald V. Jackson, Accelerated Indexing Systems, comp. *Federal Census Indexes, 1800-90*. [database on-line] Provo, UT: Ancestry.com, checked January 2001: Barbra (sic) Kay Armstrong, compiler, *Index to the 1800 Census of New York* (Baltimore, MD: Genealogical Publishing Co., Inc, 1984); Madeline W. Crickard, compiler, *Index to the 1810 Virginia Census* (Parson, W.VA: McClain Printing Company, 1971); Automated Archives, Inc., *Marriage Records, Early- 1850. Southern States, Vol. 1*, (Kentucky, North Carolina, Tennessee, Virginia) compact disk (unknown publisher, unknown publishing location.)

## Conclusions

In summary, the evidence seems clear. If the husband of Phoebe Whitman was named George, he did not create any records in Greenbrier County, Virginia and quite probably never lived in the county. Phoebe Whitman did live in Greenbrier County by at least 1793, as a widow with teenaged children. She was the mother of at least 5 children: Julia, William, George, Holly and Phoebe Whitman the younger. These 5 siblings married and began raising families in the Anthony's Creek region of Greenbrier County well before 1820. Although the evidence is less compelling, Ann Whitman is also a member of this family.

The evidence also seems convincing that Andrew and Richard Whitman are not connected with Phoebe Whitman and her children. Andrew appears to be a German or "Dutch" immigrant who resided in Greenbrier County for several years before settling finally in Wythe County, Virginia. Richard Whitman appears to have been a transitory resident, probably moving on to Kentucky before Phoebe and her children arrived in the county.

The evidence for the existence of Judah is sparse and problematic but the analysis seems to indicate that the name is meant to be Phoebe or Widow Whitman rather than a separate individual.

The next step in this project will be to trace Phoebe Whitman and her children back to New York and hopefully connect them there to a George Whitman. Given the relatively accurate nature of the "traditions" researched so far, the project seems hopeful.